



ABOVE AND BEYOND

MEDAL OF HONOR HISTORICAL SOCIETY OF THE UNITED STATES

Volume 17, Issue 4
Jul 2025

President's Report
by Gayle Alvarez

Index

Captured Flag Citation Errors	1
Other Citation Errors	7
Known Record Corrections	13
Epilogue	14

This is a special edition of *Above and Beyond*. In previous editions, we reported that locating the flags captured during the Civil War which resulted in the Medal of Honor being awarded will never be complete and will likely be a 'Best Guess' listing due to poor record keeping back in the day. We also discovered that many of the citations awarded for the capture of a flag are also in error. Many of the citations published in the 1897 listing of Medal of Honor recipients and the citations listed on the Army MoH webpage today are vastly different. The number has grown to 41 citation errors but there are likely more as yet undiscovered. Most of these deal with which flag was actually captured. The ones discovered so far comprise Part 1 of this edition.

We also uncovered a number of other citation errors. Those comprise Part 2 of this edition.

Comprising Part 3 are known record corrections, some of which have been corrected on the Army MoH webpage, but most have not. The Navy doesn't seem to have a webpage dedicated to naval Medal of Honor citations. If you are aware of other citation errors or approved record corrections, please let us know.

This listing does not address the vast number of birth and accreditation errors, only the citations. A very special thank you to Karl Jensen, Ray Johnston and Bill Sweeney for their efforts in helping compile this listing.

You may have noticed a slight change in format. Microsoft recently announced they are discontinuing the program Publisher, so we are switching to Word.

Captured Flag Citation Errors – Part 1

All citations are from the 1897 MoH citation listing unless otherwise indicated. The first date provided is the award date; the second date is the date of action.

Ammerman, Robert W. His citation states he captured the flag of the 8th NC Inf. The 1887 Congressional document listing captured flags, and the *The Returned Battle Flags* book recorded it as the 30th NC. The Official Records of the War of the Rebellion, hereinafter referred to as OR, recorded the unit as unknown. His flag is housed at the North Carolina Museum of History in Raleigh, NC as the 30th NC.

Ammerman, Robert W.	Jan. 31, 1865	Spottsylvania, Va.	May 12, 1864	Capture of battle flag of 8th North Carolina (C. S. A.).
Priv., Co. B, 148th Pa. Inf.				

Benjamin, John F. His citation states that he captured the 9th VA Inf flag. The 1887 Congressional document also says 9th VA as does the OR. The flag is housed at the Museum of the Confederacy (MOC), now the American Civil War Museum at Historic Tredegar in Richmond, Virginia, and they believe it was misidentified and is actually the flag of the 29th VA Inf.

Benjamin, John F.	Apr. 24, 1865	Sailors Creek, Va.	Apr. 6, 1865	Capture of battle flag of 9th Virginia Infantry (C. S. A.).
Corp., Co. M, 2d N. Y. Cav.				

Box, Thomas J. His citation action date is likely in error. Both the OR and the Alabama Dept of Archives & History in Montgomery, AL, which holds his flag, states that his action was on 15 May 1864, not the 14th.

Box, Thomas J.	Captain, Company D, 27th Indiana Infantry.		
At Resaca, Ga., May 14, 1864.	Capture of flag of the 38th Alabama Infantry (C. S. A.).		
R—Bedford, Ind.			
B—NR.			

Citation from 1927 listing as the 1897 is blurred.

Buckley, Dennis (Denis). His current citation states he captured the 31st MS flag. His original citation and the 1887 Congressional document recorded that it was the 1st MS flag. The location of his flag is currently unknown.

Buckley, Denis Priv., Co. G, 136th N. Y. Inf.	Apr. 7, 1865	Peach Tree Creek, Ga.	July 20, 1864	Capture of flag of 1st Missis- sippi (C. S. A.).
---	--------------	--------------------------	---------------	---

Burke, Thomas, 5th NY Cav. Most sources list his place of action as Hanover, VA, this includes the 1897 citation book and the citation currently listed on the Army's MoH webpage. Burke gave an interview for both the *Deeds of Valor* and the *Stories of American Heroism* books. In the books, the action clearly took place at Hanover, PA. The OR also states the action was at Hanover, PA. The Army review board minutes don't name a place but the 1915 citation listing they reference lists it as Hanover, PA. In *Deeds of Valor*, Burke stated, "When I took the prisoners, flag and arms to headquarters, General Kilpatrick complimented me very highly. The colors which I captured were those of the Thirteenth Virginia Regiment." General Kilpatrick turned in the flag and it was recorded as WD#17 which is now housed at the MOC. It's capture information is 13th VA Cav, captured at Hanover, PA on 30 Jun 1863. Unfortunately, it lists Kilpatrick as the capturer.

Burke, Thomas Sergt., Co. A, 5th N. Y. Cav.	Feb. 8, 1878	Hanover Court House, Va.	June 30, 1863	Capture of battle flag.
Burke, Thomas, private, Company A, Fifth New York Cavalry.	Feb. 11, 1878	Hanover, Pa.	June 30, 1863.	Capture of battle flag.

Caldwell, Daniel G. His current citation states he captured the 33rd NC Inf flag, but an in-depth article states it was the 23rd NC. The captured flag is in the care of the MOC, and their listing says 23rd NC. Very little remains of it. His original citation does not name a unit.

Caldwell, Daniel Sergt. Co. H, 13th Pa. Cav.	Feb. 13, 1865	Hatcher's Run, Va.	Feb. 6, 1865	Capture of flag.
--	---------------	--------------------	--------------	------------------

Carey, Hugh. His current citation on the Army MoH webpage places his action on 2 Jul. A historian at Gettysburg Park says 2 Jul is incorrect, and that Carey's action took place on 3 July. The Army issued a record correction in Aug 2015. His flag is at the MOC and it concurs with 3 July.

Carey, Hugh Sergt., Co. E, 82d N. Y. Inf.	Feb. 6, 1888	Gettysburg, Pa.	July 2, 1863	Captured the flag of the 7th Virginia Infantry (C. S. A.).
---	--------------	-------------------------	--------------	---

Connell, Trustrim. His current citation states he captured the 10th VA Inf flag. His captured flag is also listed as the 10th GA infantry flag. Both the MOC and the Georgia Capitol Museum in Atlanta, GA claim to have it as the 10th GA. The MOC says that the 10 VA wasn't at Sailor's Creek that day. His original citation does not name a unit.

Connell, Trustrim Corp., Co. I, 138th Pa. Inf.	Apr. 24, 1865	Sailors Creek, Va.	Apr. 6, 1865	Capture of flag.
--	---------------	----------------------------	--------------	------------------

Cunningham, Frances M. His citation reads that he captured the 12th VA Inf flag. The MOC has the flag and lists it as the 12th NC Inf.

Cunningham, Francis M. 1st Sergt. Co. H, 1st W. Va. Cav.	Apr. 24, 1865	Sailors Creek, Va.	Apr. 6, 1865	Capture of battle flag of 12th Virginia Infantry (C. S. A.).
--	---------------	----------------------------	--------------	---

Davis, John and Hudson, Aaron both are credited with capturing Worrill Grays flag. That flag is housed in the Georgia Capitol Museum in Atlanta, GA and is recorded as the 6th Georgia State Troops, Company D, Worrill Grays. The captured flag book gives the capture date as 20 May 1865. Their citation reads April 1865. No OR has surfaced, and the 1887 Congressional document didn't list it. The museum website doesn't provide any capture information.

Davis, John Priv., Co. F, 17th Ind. Mtd. Inf.	June 17, 1865	Culloden, Ga.	Apr. , 1865	Capture of flag of Worrill Grays (C. S. A.).
Hudson, Aaron R. Priv., Co. C, 17th Ind. Mtd. Inf.	June 17, 1865	Culloden, Ga.	April —, 1865	Capture of flag of Worrill Grays (C. S. A.).

Donaldson, John P. His current citation states he captured the flag of the 4th VA Cav. His flag is housed at the MOC and they show it as the 14th VA Cav. His original citation did not name a unit nor does the OR.

Donaldson, John Sergt., Co. L, 4th Pa. Cav.	Apr. 24, 1865	Appomattox Court House, Va.	Apr. 9, 1865	Capture of flag.
---	---------------	--------------------------------	--------------	------------------

Dore, George H. The OR and the 1897 citation book both show he captured a flag. His current citation says he saved his own colors. The flag is housed at the MOC as WD #63.

Dore, George H Sergt., Co. D, 126th N. Y. Inf.	Dec. 1, 1864	Gettysburg, Pa. ...	July 3, 1863	Capture of flag.
--	--------------	---------------------	--------------	------------------

Edwards, David. His flag is at the North Carolina Museum of History, Raleigh, NC. They list it as misidentified as 24th NC but is probably the 56th NC. Neither his citation nor the OR name a unit that the flag was captured from.

Edwards, David Priv., Co. H, 146th N. Y. Inf.	Apr. 27, 1865	Five Forks, Va. ...	Apr. 1, 1865	Capture of flag.
---	---------------	---------------------	--------------	------------------

Fernald, Albert E. His current citation states he captured the 9th VA Inf. The flag he captured is at the MOC and they list it as tentatively the 49th NC Inf and that the 9th VA Inf flag had already been captured in that same battle. Neither his original citation nor the OR name a unit that the flag was captured from.

Fernald, Albert E. 1st Lieut. Co. F, 20th Me. Inf.	Apr. 27, 1865	Five Forks, Va. ...	Apr. 1, 1865	Capture of flag.
--	---------------	---------------------	--------------	------------------

Goettel, Philip. His date of action is recorded as 24 Nov 1863, Ringgold, GA. His flag is at the MOC and the capture date is listed as 27 Nov 1863. The OR stated that he captured both a large flag and a battery guidon. The flags bore no inscription and the units were unknown. The MOC tentatively identified the flag as Semple's Battery, AL Light Artillery.

Goettel, Philip Priv., Co. B, 149th N. Y. Inf.	June 24, 1865	Lookout Moun- tain, Tenn.	Nov. 24, 1863	Capture of flag.
--	---------------	------------------------------	---------------	------------------

Greenawalt, Abraham. A flag credited to Greenawalt is at the Alabama Dept of Archives & History, Montgomery, AL and shows the unit to be the 16th AL Inf. His current and original citation read that he captured a corps headquarters flag. The 1887 Congressional document also states it is the 16th AL flag.

Greenawalt, Abraham Priv., Co. G, 104th Ohio Inf.	Feb. 4, 1865	Franklin, Tenn. ...	Nov. 30, 1864	Capture of corps headquarters flag (C. S. A.).
---	--------------	---------------------	---------------	---

Hanford, Edward R. His citation says he captured the 32nd VA Cav flag, as does the OR and the 1887 Congressional document. The MOC has his flag and says it's either the 34th or the 36th VA Cav.

Hanford, Edward R. Priv., Co. H, 2d U. S. Cav.	Oct. 14, 1864	Woodstock, Va. ...	Oct. 9, 1864	Capture of flag of 32d Battalion Virginia Cavalry (C. S. A.).
--	---------------	--------------------	--------------	--

Holmes, William T. His citation says he captured the flag of the 27th VA Inf. The flag is housed at the MOC as the 57th VA Inf. The MOC states that the 27th VA wasn't there that day.

Holmes, William T. Priv., Co. A, 3d Ind. Cav.	Apr. 24, 1865	Sailors Creek, Va. ...	Apr. 6, 1865	Capture of flag of 27th Vir- ginia Infantry (C. S. A.).
---	---------------	------------------------	--------------	--

Jennings, James T. His citation recorded his action at Weldon Railroad on 20 August 1864. A flag reported to be the one captured is held at the North Carolina Museum of History, Raleigh, NC, and states it was captured at Globe Tavern on 19 August. This was part of the Weldon Railroad August 1864 action. His date of action may be in error, although the OR gives the date of the 20th twice.

Jennings, James T. Priv., Co. K, 56th Pa. Inf.	Dec. 1, 1864	Weldon Railroad, Va.	Aug. 20, 1864	Capture of flag of 55th North Carolina Infantry (C. S. A.).
--	--------------	-------------------------	---------------	--

Kemp, Joseph. His citation and the OR state he captured the 31st NC flag. The 1887 Congressional document and the captured flags book do not name a unit. His flag is housed at the North Carolina Museum of History in Raleigh, NC as the 33rd NC.

Kemp, Joseph 1st Sergt. Co. D, 5th Mich. Inf.	Dec. 1, 1864	Wilderness, Va....	May 6, 1864	Capture of flag of 31st North Carolina (C. S. A.).
---	--------------	--------------------	-------------	--

Leslie, Frank and Mandy, Harry J. Their citations record they captured the 3rd VA Inf flag on 15 Aug 1864. The OR and the 1887 Congressional document recorded the date as 16 Aug.

Leslie, Frank Priv., Co. B, 4th N. Y. Cav.	Aug. 22, 1864	Front Royal, Va....	Aug. 15, 1864	Capture of colors of 3d Virginia Infantry (C. S. A.).
Mandy, Harry J. 1st Sergt. Co. B, 4th N. Y. Cav.	Aug. 22, 1864	Front Royal, Va....	Aug. 15, 1864	Capture of flag of 3d Virginia Infantry (C. S. A.).

Marquette, Charles. His current citation contains an error that didn't exist until 1978. The citation for Marquette for 1886, 1897, 1940 and 1968 MoH publications reads: "Capture of Flag" The OR that shows his recommendation states that it is for capturing a flag at Petersburg, VA. The OR showing his listing as a recipient, states "Capture of flag at Petersburg, Va." The flag he captured is at the MOC and is listed as War Dept flag #362, Headquarters flag, McComb's TN Brigade. The citation that began appearing in 1978 credits him with planting the colors on the enemy breastwork.

Marquette, Charles Sergt., Co. F, 93d Pa. Inf.	Apr. 24, 1865	Petersburg, Va....	Apr. 2, 1865	Capture of flag.
--	---------------	--------------------	--------------	------------------

Marsh, Albert. His citation names his place of action as Spotsylvania. The 1887 Congressional document and the captured flags book list it as Wilderness.

Marsh, Albert Sergt, Co. B, 64th N. Y. Inf.	Dec. 1, 1864	Spotsylvania, Va. .	May 12, 1864	Capture of flag.
---	--------------	---------------------	--------------	------------------

Mattingly, Henry B. Two museums lay claim to his flag. The Old Statehouse Museum in Little Rock, AR holds a flag with his name written in the center of it. Stones River National Battlefield, in Murfreesboro, TN also claims to have his flag.

Mattingly, Henry B. Priv., Co. B, 10th Ky. Inf.	Apr. 7, 1865	Jonesboro, Ga.....	Sept. 1, 1864	Capture of flags of 6th and 7th Arkansas Infantry (C.S.A.).
---	--------------	--------------------	---------------	---

McDonald, George E. A flag numbered WD #268 was identified as McDonald's flag and was sent to Georgia. In 1908, Gen. Henry Abbot sent a flag to the War Department claiming he never turned in McDonald's flag and the one he was now sending to Washington was the one that McDonald captured and gave to him six days after the battle. This flag was also sent to Georgia. The flag is sometimes recorded as 26th NC but was most likely the 26th GA. This as per a 31 Mar 1865 letter to Maj Gen Parke from Bvt Brig Gen Abbot that the flag captured "belonged to the 26th Georgia regiment...suspect McDonald confounded the 26th Georgia with the 26th North Carolina." [sic] Neither his citation nor the OR name a unit. The Georgia Capitol Museum in Atlanta, GA claims to hold the WD#268 flag.

McDonald, George E. Priv., Co. L, 1st Conn. Art.	July 21, 1865	Fort Stedman, Va. .	Mar. 25, 1865	Capture of flag.
--	---------------	---------------------	---------------	------------------

McWhorter, Walter F. The flag he captured at Sailor's Creek was not the 6th TN. According to the museum holding the flag, that unit was never in the Eastern Theater and never had a flag captured. His flag is at the Tennessee State Museum in Nashville and is currently listed as an unknown Virginia Flag.

McWhorter, Walter F. Comd'g Sergt., Co. E, 3d W. Va. Cav.	Apr. 24, 1865	Sailors Creek, Va..	Apr. 6, 1865	Capture of flag of 6th Tennessee Infantry (C. S. A.).
---	---------------	---------------------	--------------	---

Miller, John. Historians are in disagreement over who really captured the two flags. The OR sometimes uses the name Dave Miller. These are two different men. Dave's obituary in 1880 states he captured 2 flags. John died in 1909, and his obituary notes the capture of 2 flags. The MoH rolls and 1916 Review Board use the name John.

Miller, John Corp., Co. G, 8th Ohio Inf.	Dec. 1, 1864	Gettysburg, Pa. . .	July 3, 1863	Capture of two flags.
--	--------------	---------------------	--------------	-----------------------

Morse, Benjamin. His citation says he captured the 4th GA Battery. The OR also says 4th GA. The 1887 Congressional document says 4th VA. The MOC has a flag they believe to be his, but it is the 4th VA Inf. The MOC and 1887 Congressional document also say captured at Wilderness whereas his citation says Spotsylvania.

Morse, Benjamin Corp., Co. C, 3d Mich. Inf.	Feb. 24, 1861	Spotsylvania, Va...	May 12, 1864	Capture of colors of 4th Georgia Battery (C. S. A.).
--	---------------	---------------------	--------------	--

Ransbottom, Alfred. His current citation states he captured a Mississippi flag, but a flag housed in Missouri designated as the 2nd & 6th Reg't Infantry Missouri CSA, was captured by a member of the 97th Ohio Inf during the battle of Franklin, TN on 30 Nov 1864. That matches Ransbottom's action. The original citation does not name a unit nor does the OR.

Ransbottom, Alfred 1st Sergt. Co. K, 97th Ohio Inf.	Feb. 22, 1865	Franklin, Tenn ...	Nov. 30, 1864	Capture of flag.
--	---------------	--------------------	---------------	------------------

Reynolds, George. Reynolds is on record as capturing a Virginia State flag. The MOC claims to have this flag and says it's either the 22nd VA Infantry or 23rd Bn VA Infantry. The OR says Virginia state flag which matches the MOC image. Circa 2024, an auction house sold a flag remanent that had a note attached to it, allegedly written by Reynolds in 1866, stating that the remanent was part of the 28th VA flag he had captured. There is no known documentation that says he captured the 28th VA.

Reynolds, George Priv., Co. M, 9th N. Y. Cav.	Sept. 27, 1864	Winchester, Va ...	Sept. 19, 1864	Capture of Virginia State flag.
--	----------------	--------------------	----------------	---------------------------------

Ricksecker, John H. His current and original citation credit him with the 16th AL Inf flag. Ricksecker's flag is housed at the MOC and is listed as an unknown unit.

Ricksecker, John H. Priv., Co. D, 104th Ohio Inf.	Feb. 4, 1865	Franklin, Tenn ...	Nov. 30, 1864	Capture of flag of 16th Alabama Artillery (C. S. A.).
--	--------------	--------------------	---------------	---

Riddell, Rudolph and Riley, Thomas. Both are currently credited with capturing the flag of the 6th AL. However, it is reported that the 6th AL Cav wasn't at Sailor's Creek where Riddle captured his flag. Riddell's flag was given WD# 295 which is currently housed at the MOC as an unknown unit flag. Riley's flag was captured at Fort Blakely, AL and given WD # 453. It is housed at the Alabama Dept of Archives & History, Montgomery, AL as the 6th AL flag. Neither of their original citations name a unit.

Riddell, Rudolph Lieut., Co. I, 61st N. Y. Inf.	Apr. 24, 1865	Sailors Creek, Va...	Apr. 6, 1865	Capture of flag
Riley, Thomas Priv., Co. D, 1st La. Cav.	June 8, 1865	Blakely, Ala ...	Apr. 4, 1865	Capture of flag.

Sancrainte (Sanscrainte), Charles F. His citation says he captured the flag of the 5th TX, but the 5th TX wasn't in that action. Another flag was captured at the same time, that of the 17th & 18th Texas dismounted Cavalry. Sancrainte was not the man who captured it, but the man who did wrote a letter noting the captures and gave the true name of the unit whose flag Sancrainte did capture, the 5th CSA Infantry. Additionally, the history of the 5th CSA Inf is that they were assigned to a Texas Brigade and were soon informally called "5th Texas" hence the confusion over the name of the flag. The Texas State Museum has the 17 & 18th TX flag. Sanscrainte's flag, the 5th CSA infantry flag, is housed at the Tennessee State Museum in Nashville, TN.

Sancrainte, Charles F Priv., Co. B, 15th Mich. Inf.	July 25, 1862	Atlanta, Ga ...	July 22, 1864	Voluntarily scaled the enemy's breastworks and signaled to his commanding officer to charge; also in single combat captured the colors of the 5th Texas regiment.
--	---------------	-----------------	---------------	---

Shahan, Emisire. His citation recorded that he captured the 76th GA Infantry flag. Georgia didn't have a 76th Infantry. His certificate shows 26th GA but this is also suspect. The Georgia Capitol Museum in Atlanta, GA houses the flag numbered WD #294 and lists it as the 16th GA Infantry flag. Flag WD #294 is credited in the returned flag book to Emisire Shahan, captured 6 Apr 1865 at Sailors Creek, VA.

Shahand, Amzi Corp., Co. A, 1st W. Va. Cav.	Apr. 24, 1865	Sailors Creek, Va...	Apr. 6, 1865	Capture of flag of 76th Georgia Infantry (C. S. A.).
--	---------------	----------------------	--------------	--

Simmons, William T. His citation states he captured the flag of the 34th AL Infantry. It was most likely the 29th AL. As it turns out the 34th wasn't in the vicinity that day. The error was discovered in 1905 when the flag was sent to Louisiana as the 24th LA flag where after examination it was determined not to be one of their flags.

Simmons, William T. Lieut., Co. C, 11th Mo. Inf.	Feb. 22, 1865	Nashville, Tenn. . . .	Dec. 16, 1864	Capture of flag of 34th Alabama Infantry (C. S. A.).
--	---------------	------------------------	---------------	--

Sherman, Marshall. The flag he captured is sometimes debated. The OR stated it was the 58th VA Infantry. The Minnesota Historical Society in Minnesota has a photo of him standing in front of the flag in question and identifies it as the 28th VA. His current citation also states it was the 28th VA but the original citation states it was the 58th.

Sherman, Marshall. Priv., Co. C, 1st Minn. Inf.	Dec. 1, 1864	Gettysburg, Pa.	July 3, 1863	Capture of flag of 58th Virginia Infantry (C. S. A.).
---	--------------	-------------------------	--------------	---

Thompkins, aka Tompkins, George W. His current citation states he captured the flag of the 49th AL Inf. His original citation recorded it as the 59th AL Inf. The flag is in the collection of the Alabama Dept of Archives & History in Montgomery, AL as the 59th AL Inf.

Tompkins, George W. Corp., Co. F, 124th N. Y. Inf.	Apr. 4, 1865	Petersburg, Va.	Mar. 25, 1865	Capture of flag of 59th Alabama Infantry (C. S. A.).
--	--------------	-------------------------	---------------	--

Welch, George W. His current citation says he captured the flag of the 13th AL Inf. The MOC has his flag and says it's the 17th AL Inf. His original citation did not name a unit. The OR specifically stated the unit was not known.

Welch, George Priv., Co. A, 11th Mo. Inf.	Feb. 22, 1865	Nashville, Tenn. . . .	Dec. 16, 1864	Capture of flag.
---	---------------	------------------------	---------------	------------------

Wiley, James. His date of action appears to have been 2 July not 3. Neither the 1887 Congressional document nor the captured flag book gives a date. He is credited with capturing the 48th GA Inf flag which is housed at the Georgia Capitol Museum in Atlanta, GA. Only 1 Union OR reference gives a date, that being 3 Jul. An after-action report by a CSA Brigade commander noted that on 2 July, the 48th Georgia Regiment "suffered more severely than any other in the command...the colors were shot down no less than seven times, and were finally lost." Additionally, a newspaper article on the CSA man who bore the flag at the beginning of the battle noted its capture on the 2nd. Adding even more mystery, the CSA man said he met the man who captured his flag after the war. Wiley died in February 1865.

Wiley, James. Sergt., Co. B, 59th N. Y. Inf.	Dec. 1, 1864	Gettysburg, Pa.	July 3, 1863	Capture of flag of a Georgia regiment.
--	--------------	-------------------------	--------------	--

Wilson, Christopher W. His citation says he captured the 56th VA Inf flag. The MOC has the flag and says it's that of the 58th VA Inf.

WILSON, CHRISTOPHER W. At Spotsylvania, Va., May 12, 1864. R—West Meriden, Conn. B—Ireland.	Private, Company E, 73d New York Infantry. Took the flag from the wounded color bearer and carried it in the charge over the Confederate works, in which charge he also captured the colors of the 56th Virginia (C. S. A.), bringing off both flags in safety.
---	--

Citation from 1927 listing as his award was in 1898.

Wood, Daniel A. Reportedly captured the flag of the 18th FL Inf. Florida didn't have an 18th Inf. It is thought to be either the 1st or 8th FL BN. The location of the flag is currently unknown.

Woods, Daniel A. Priv., Co. K, 1st Va. Cav.	Apr. 24, 1865	Sailors Creek, Va. . . .	Apr. 6, 1865	Capture of flag of 18th Florida Infantry (C. S. A.).
---	---------------	--------------------------	--------------	--

Other Citation Errors

Listed alphabetically, not by conflict.

Bumgarner, William. His award date began appearing as 2 Apr 1862 at Petersburg, VA with the 1926 citation listing. His true action was Vicksburg, MS on 22 May 1863. The Awards and Decorations office attempted to get it corrected in 2019 and asked the Center of Military History (CMH) to update their webpage. The CMH no longer lists Medal of Honor citations, and the Army citation webpage still lists his action at Petersburg in 1862.

Bumgarner, William July 10, 1894 | Vicksburg, Miss. May 22, 1863 | Gallantry in the charge of the
Sergt., Co. A, 4th Va. Inf. | "volunteer storming party."

Boutwell, John W. His award date is a conundrum. The 1915 supplement of Medal of Honor awards used by the 1916 review board lists it as 26 Aug 1908 yet the recap of the review of his record lists the date as 28 Jan 1910. The 1908 date is likely the true date as a newspaper article in the *Burlington Free Press* on 29 Aug 1908 announced the award. Neither his 1948, 1968 nor 1978 citations list an award date. The current listing on the Army MoH webpage doesn't have an award date either.

2179 | Boutwell, John W., private, Company B, Eighteenth New Hampshire Infantry. | Aug. 26, 1908 | Petersburg, Va. | Apr. 2, 1865 | Brought off from the picket line, under heavy fire, a comrade who had been shot through both legs.

Boyington, Gregory. Historians have long disputed his official score. His current USMC citation credits him with 28. His original citation says 20. The American Fighter Aces Association credits him with 24. The citations on both the Army and CMOHS webpages say 26.

whelming odds, Major Boyington personally destroyed twenty of the numerous Japanese planes shot down by his squadron and by his forceful leadership developed the combat readiness in his command which was a distinctive factor in the Allied aerial achievements in this vitally strategic area."

Dougherty, James. In January 2016, the USMC informed us that Dougherty's information is wrong. He was aboard the *Benecia*, not the *Carondelet* and his citation should read, "On board the U.S.S. *Benecia*, attack on and the capture of the Korean forts June 11, 1871, for seeking out and killing the commanding officer of the Korean forces." The error dates back to the 1949 Navy citation book.

JAMES DOUGHERTY.

Private marlue on board of the U. S. S. *Benecia*; for seeking out and killing the commanding officer of the Korean forces.

Citation from 1888 Navy MoH book.

Garcia, Marcario. In what has to be the ultimate insult, the Army spelled his name wrong. His true name is Macario, the Army spelled it Marcario. He signed his WWII Draft Card as Macario. The National Archives recap of his service and his Medal of Honor order, illustrated below, spell his name correctly. His death certificate and obituaries spell it Macario as does his headstone and widow's obituary.

Field Title	Value	Meaning
ARMY SERIAL NUMBER	38246362	38246362
NAME	GARCIA#MACARIO#####	GARCIA#MACARIO#####
RESIDENCE: STATE	85	TEXAS
RESIDENCE: COUNTY	157	FORT BEND
PLACE OF ENLISTMENT	8567	HOUSTON TEXAS

Staff Sergeant *Macario Garcia* (Army serial No. 38246362) (then private first class), while an acting squad leader of Company B, 22d Infantry Regiment, Army of the United States, on 27 November 1944 near Grosshau, Germany, single-handedly assaulted two enemy machine-gun emplacements. Attacking prepared (citation cropped)

Gile, Frank. His citation lists his ship as the *Lehigh* but the OR describing the action notes that Gile, Young and Williams were “seamen of the *Nahant*”. The *Nahant* came to the aide of the *Lehigh*. When Gile acknowledged receiving his Medal in June 1864, he noted on the letter that his ship was in fact the *Nahant*, not the *Lehigh*. The citation correction has never been made.

FRANK S. GILE.

Landsman on board the U. S. S. *Lehigh*, Charleston Harbor, November 16, 1863; for gallant behavior in passing lines between the *Lehigh* and *Nahant* in a open boat while exposed to a heavy fire from the forts in Charleston Harbor. Advanced in his rating.

Citation from 1888 Navy MoH book

Goettler, Harold E. His citation and MoH order list his rank as First Lieutenant, but this is questionable. His recommendation for the DSC (which was upgraded to the MoH) is as a Second Lieutenant as is his original burial card, the ship manifest returning his remains to the United States in 1921, his VA Index card and his original headstone on his original grave. The 50th Aero Sqdn history states that both he and Bleckley were recommended for promotion to 1st Lieutenant. If either received a posthumous promotion, the order has not surfaced.

<p>*GOETTLER, HAROLD ERNEST..... Near Binarville, France, Oct. 6, 1918. R—Chicago, Ill. B—Chicago, Ill. G. O. No. 56, W. D. 1922.</p>	<p>First lieutenant, pilot, 50th Aero Squadron, Air Service. Lieutenant Goettler, with his observer, Second Lieut. Erwin R. Bleckley, 130th Field Artillery, left the airdrome late in the afternoon on their second trip to drop supplies to a battalion of the 77th Division which had been cut off by the enemy in the Argonne Forest. Having been subjected on the first trip to violent fire from the enemy, they attempted on the second trip to come still lower in order to get the packages even more precisely on the designated spot. In the course of this mission the plane was brought down by enemy rifle and machine-gun fire from the ground, resulting in the instant death of Lieutenant Goettler. In attempting and performing this mission Lieutenant Goettler showed the highest possible contempt of personal danger, devotion to duty, courage, and valor. Posthumously awarded. Medal presented to mother, Mrs. Gertrude Goettler.</p>
---	---

Citation from 1926 Army MoH book

Kedenburg, John. His action location is listed on his order as Republic of Vietnam but his NARA service recap lists Laos. His MoH recommendation says classified. His current citation says, “deep within enemy-held territory” and does not list a specific location.

Field Title	Value	Meaning
Last Name	KEDENBURG	KEDENBURG
Given Names	JOHN JAMES	JOHN JAMES
Country	LA	Laos

Specialist Five *John J. Kedenburg*, [REDACTED], United States Army, Command and Control Detachment North, Forward Operating Base 2, 5th Special Forces Group (Airborne), 1st Special Forces, who distinguished himself by conspicuous gallantry and intrepidity in the Republic of Vietnam on 13 June 1968, while serving as advisor to a long-range reconnaissance team of

Lakin, Thomas. His citation credits him with rescuing two men that day.

THOMAS LAKIN.

Seaman on board of the U. S. S. *Narragansett*; gallant conduct in jumping overboard from the *Narragansett*, at the navy-yard, Mare Island, Cal., twice, on the 24th November, 1874, and rescuing two men of that ship from drowning.

The ship logbook notes that the first rescue was unsuccessful, the ship rescue boat reached the jumper, Charles Kellogg, first. Two other men had also joined the attempted rescue. The ship logbook also notes the second action that day; Lakin successfully rescuing Bart Gannon who had fallen overboard.

Logan, Hugh. He is currently erroneously listed as a posthumous recipient. He survived his action and died in 1903.

HUGH LOGAN.

Captain of the afterguard; was one of the crew of the U. S. S. *Rhode Island*, on the night of December 30, 1862, which was engaged in saving the lives of the officers and crew of the *Monitor*. They had saved a number, and it was owing to their gallantry and zeal in the desire to save others that they became separated from the *Rhode Island*, and were adrift for some hours.

Citation from 1888 Navy MoH book

Loyd, George, Civil War. Loyd's award date was 24 Apr 1865 but over the years he was confused and intertwined with George Loyd of the Indian Campaigns. Currently, both George Loyds have the same award date of 16 April 1891.

Loyd, George..... Sergt., Co. I, 7th U. S. Cav.	Apr. 16, 1891	Wounded Knee Creek, S. Dak.	Dec. 29, 1890	Bravery, especially after having been severely wounded through the lung.
Loyd, George..... Priv., Co. A, 122d Ohio Inf.	Apr. 24, 1865	Petersburg, Va....	Apr. 2, 1865	Capture of division flag of General Heth.

Luke, Jr. Frank. His citation states he shot down 3 balloons on his last mission. In depth research, detailed extensively in 2 recent books, reveals that he shot down one. Two of his squadron members took out the other two.

*** Frank Luke, jr., second lieutenant, 1st Pursuit Group, 27th Aero Squadron, Air Service. For conspicuous gallantry and intrepidity above and beyond the call of duty in action with the enemy near Murvaux, France, September 29, 1918. After having previously destroyed a number of enemy aircraft within 17 days, he voluntarily started on a patrol after German observation balloons. Though pursued by eight German planes, which were protecting the enemy balloon line, he unhesitatingly attacked and shot down in flames three German balloons, being himself under heavy fire from ground batteries and the hostile**

Citation from 1919 Army MoH book

Mitchell, Thomas. His citation states that he rescued M.F. Caulan. The man's true name is Michael F. Conlan.

THOMAS MITCHELL.

Landsman, serving on board U. S. S. *Richmond*; for rescuing from drowing M. F. Caulan, first-class boy, serving with him on the same vessel, at Shanghai, China, November 17, 1879. (G. O. 326, Oct. 18, 1884.)

Citation from 1917 Navy MoH book

Prance, George. Prance's and several other Navy recipients' current citations are much more detailed than the originals published in 1888. The changes originated with the Navy's 1949 Medal of Honor publication.

The current citation reads, "On board the U.S.S. Ticonderoga during attacks on Fort Fisher, 24 and 25 December 1864; and 13 to 15 January 1865. Despite heavy return fire by the enemy and the explosion of the 100-pounder Parrott rifle which killed 8 men and wounded 12 more, Prance as captain of a gun, performed his duties with skill and courage during the first 2 days of battle. As his ship again took position on the line on the 13th, he remained steadfast as the Ticonderoga maintained a well-placed fire upon the batteries on shore, and thereafter as she materially lessened the power of guns on the mound which had been turned upon our assaulting columns. During this action the flag was planted on one of the strongest fortifications possessed by the rebels."

GEORGE PRANCE.

Captain of the maintop on board of the U. S. S. *Ticonderoga*, in the attacks on Fort Fisher, December 24 and 25, 1864, and January 13, 14, and 15, 1865; commended for coolness and good conduct as captain of a gun.

Citation from 1888 Navy MoH book

Robinson, Robert G. and Talbot, Ralph. Documents have surfaced in Robinson's Official Military Personnel File which is available online, that suggest they were both wounded on 13 October 1918, which is the day before the second MoH action is reported to have taken place. This would necessarily place their second date of action on the 13th, not the 14th. Additionally, Robinson's rating wasn't Gunnery Sergeant until 1 Nov 1918.

ROBERT GUY ROBINSON.

Gunnery sergeant, United States Marine Corps. "For extraordinary heroism as observer in the First Marine Aviation Force at the front in France. He not only participated successfully in numerous raids into the enemy territory, but on October 8, 1918, while conducting an air raid in company with planes from Squadron 218, Royal Air Force, he was attacked by nine enemy scouts and in the fight which followed he shot down one of the enemy planes. Also, on October 14, 1918, while on an air raid over Pittham, Belgium, his plane and one other became separated from their formation on account of motor trouble and were attacked by 12 enemy scouts. In

SECOND LIEUT. RALPH TALBOT, UNITED STATES MARINE CORPS.

"For exceptional meritorious service and extraordinary heroism while attached to Squadron C, First Marine Aviation Force, in France. He participated in numerous air raids into enemy territory, and on October 8, 1918, while on such a raid, he was attacked by 9 enemy scouts, and in the fight that followed shot down an enemy plane. Also, on October 14, 1918, while on a raid over Pittham, Belgium, Lieutenant Talbot and another plane became detached from the formation on account of motor trouble, and were attacked by 12 enemy scouts. During the severe fight that followed, his plane shot down one of the enemy scouts. His observer was shot through the

(citations cropped)

Citation excerpts from 1923 Navy MoH book

Rose, Gary M. His action took place in Laos. The President's remarks during his presentation say Laos, and the DoD press release says Laos, but his citation and order read "deep in enemy controlled territory".

Sergeant Gary M. Rose distinguished himself by acts of gallantry and intrepidity while serving as a Special Forces Medic with a company-sized exploitation force, Special Operations Augmentation, Command and Control Central, 5th Special Forces Group (Airborne), 1st Special Forces, Republic of Vietnam. Between 11 and 14 September 1970, Sergeant Rose's company was continuously engaged by a well-armed and numerically superior hostile force deep in enemy-controlled territory. Enemy B-40

Smith, Thomas, Interim recipient. His citation reads: "For rescuing from drowning William Kent, coxswain of the U.S.S. *Enterprise*, off Para, Brazil, 1 October 1878." The USS *Enterprise* was nowhere near Brazil on that date. Its dates in Brazilian waters were 25 May 1878 through 6 Sep 1878. She was on a survey expedition on the Amazon River and anchored back in New York late 25 Sep 1878. The man Smith rescued (William Kent) was promoted Coxswain (his rank at the time of rescue) on 1 Jul 1878 so all this puts Smith's action date between 1 Jul and 6 Sep 1878. He was presented the Medal aboard the USS *Enterprise* in New York Harbor on 29 Oct 1878. The ship's log is silent on his action; there is no mention of it. Fortunately, the letters recommending Smith for the award are available and courtesy of a contact at the NARA, we now have the information. The letter citing the action was written on 4 Sep 1878 and noted the action took place "yesterday." So Smith's action took place on 3 Sep 1878, not Oct as recorded.

THOMAS SMITH.

Seaman; for rescuing from drowning William Kent, cockswain of the U. S. S. *Enterprise*, off Para, Brazil, October 1, 1878.

Citation from 1888 Navy MoH book.

Sprague, John W. His action took place on 22 Jul 1864. His current citation reads 1862.

Sprague, John W Col. 63d Ohio Inf.	Jan. 18, 1894	Decatur, Ga.	July 22, 1864	With a small command defeated an overwhelming force of the enemy and saved the trains of the corps.
---	---------------	----------------------	---------------	---

Stewart, James. His citation credits him with rescuing Midshipman Osterhaus on 1 Feb 1872. By 1872, Hugo Osterhaus was an Ensign having attained that rank in July 1871. His record does show service on the *Plymouth* from 1871-1873 so either the date of action is wrong or Osterhaus's rating in Stewart's citation is in error. Neither are listed on the *Plymouth's* muster rolls due to their rating and branch of service and the log books are not available.

JAMES STEWART.

Corporal of the marine guard on board of the U. S. S. *Plymouth*; jumped overboard in the harbor of Villefrance, February 1, 1872, and saved Midshipman Osterhaus from drowning.

Citation from 1888 Navy MoH book.

Williams, William. His citation lists his ship as the *Lehigh* but the OR describing the action notes that Gile, Young and Williams were "seamen of the *Nahant*". The *Nahant* came to the aide of the *Lehigh*. In Apr 1864, the commander of the *Nahant* submitted 3 names to the squadron commander stating that the men were awaiting their Medals of Honor. Williams was one of the men listed and was listed as aboard the *Nahant*. An endorsement by the Squadron commander noted that all three were of the *Nahant*.

WILLIAM WILLIAMS.

Landsman belonging to the U. S. S. *Lehigh*, Charleston Harbor, November 16, 1863; gallant behavior in passing lines between the *Lehigh* and *Nahant* in an open boat with two others, being at the time exposed to a heavy fire from the forts in Charleston Harbor; advanced in his rate.

Citation from 1888 Navy MoH book

York, Alvin C. His order shows his rank as Corporal but his Official Military Personnel File, which is available online, notes that he never held that rank. He was a Private First Class during his action and when promoted to Sergeant, was actually a PFC. The GAO even noted that he was paid as a PFC from 8 Jul 1918 to 31 Oct 1918. His promotion to Sergeant was 1 Nov 1918. The error was discovered in 1927 but never corrected.

Alvin C. York (Army serial No. 1910421), corporal, Company G, 328th Infantry, 82d Division. For conspicuous gallantry and intrepidity above and beyond the call of duty in action with the enemy near Châtel-Chéhéry, France, October 8, 1918. After his platoon had suffered heavy casualties and three other noncommissioned officers had become casualties Corpl. York assumed command. Fearlessly leading seven men, he charged, with great daring, a machine-gun nest which was pouring deadly and incessant fire upon his platoon. In this

(citation cropped)

Citation excerpt from 1919 Army MoH book

Young, Horatio N. His citation lists his ship as the *Lehigh* but the OR describing the action notes that Gile, Young and Williams were “seamen of the *Nahant*”. The *Nahant* came to the aide of the *Lehigh*. In Apr 1864, the commander of the *Nahant* submitted 3 names to the squadron commander stating that the men were awaiting their Medals of Honor. An endorsement by the Squadron commander noted that all three were of the *Nahant*.

HORATIO N. YOUNG.

Seaman on the U. S. S. *Lehigh*, Charleston Harbor, November 16, 1863; gallant behavior in passing lines between the *Lehigh* and *Nahant* in an open boat, being at the time exposed to a heavy fire from the forts in Charleston Harbor. Advanced in his rating.

Citation from 1888 Navy MoH book.

Zabitosky, Fred W. His action took place in Laos. His original order dated 17 Apr 1969 listed it as Republic of Vietnam. The order was amended on 20 Sep 1991 to reflect the true location of Laos. The Army MoH webpage still lists the action as “enemy controlled territory” leaving out the actual location.

Sergeant First Class Fred W. Zabitosky, RA12587913 (then Staff Sergeant), United States Army, who distinguished himself by conspicuous gallantry and intrepidity, at the risk of his life, above and beyond the call of duty within enemy controlled territory in Laos, on 19 February 1968, while serving as an assistant team leader of a nine-man Special Forces long-range reconnaissance patrol. Sergeant Zabitosky's patrol was operating deep

(citation cropped)

Known Record Corrections

The following are known record corrections, many of which are still not listed on the Army MoH webpage. The CMOHS webpage has updated most of these.

Bumgarner, William. On 26 Jul 2019, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch acknowledged that Bumgarner's action date and location were in error. His true action took place at Vicksburg on 22 May 1863.

Canfield, Heth. On 5 Sep 2012, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch corrected his date of action to 17 May 1870.

Carey, Hugh. On 27 Aug 2015, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch corrected his date of action to 3 Jul 1863.

Custer, Thomas W. On 11 Dec 2019, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch corrected his dates of action to "at Namozine Church, Va., Apr. 2, 1865 and at Sailors Creek, Va., Apr. 6, 1865."

Garland, Harry. On 13 Jul 2012, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch corrected his date of action to 20 Aug 1877.

Goodman, David. On 20 Dec 2017, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch corrected his place of action to Lynx Creek.

Grant, Lewis A. On 16 Sep 2013, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch corrected his date of action to 3 May 1863.

Himmelsback, Michael. On 5 Sep 2012, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch corrected his date of action to 17 May 1870.

Hubbard, Thomas H. On 5 Sep 2012, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch corrected his date of action to 17 May 1870.

Jackson, James. On 16 Mar 2015, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch corrected his accreditation to Iowa.

Leonard, Patrick J. On 5 Sep 2012, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch corrected his date of action to 17 May 1870.

Littleton, Herbert A. On 25 Jan 1965, the USMC notified Littleton's family that his record was being corrected to show Idaho as his home state and that future USMC citation publications would reflect this. Littleton's first enlistment was in South Dakota but after a break in service, his second enlistment was in Idaho. The 1973 citation listings and the Army webpage still accredit him to South Dakota.

McCarthy, Michael. On 13 Jul 2012, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch corrected his date of action to 17 Jun 1877.

Neibaur, Thomas C. On 22 Apr 2009, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch corrected his unit to 167th Infantry.

Raerick, John. On 20 Dec 2017, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch corrected his place of action to Lynx Creek.

Rowalt, John. On 20 Dec 2017, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch corrected his place of action to Lynx Creek.

Seward, Griffin. On 18 Dec 2009, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch corrected his date of action to 20 Oct 1869. He is still on the Army webpage as a Civil War recipient.

Smith, Charles H. (Navy) On 28 Mar 1951, the Navy Director of Medals and Awards acknowledged an error in his citation in that he was not killed during his action and that the error would be rectified. The Army webpage still lists him as a posthumous recipient.

Thompson, George W. On 5 Sep 2012, the Army Awards and Decorations Branch corrected his date of action to 17 May 1870.

Epilogue

As mentioned above, this is likely the tip of the iceberg on citation errors. There is no doubt in our minds that more will surface.

This listing does not include the known birth and accreditation location errors. They are far too numerous to count and would take several newsletters to convey all of the errors uncovered thus far. These listings are also a work in progress and are often updated when new birth and personnel records are made available.

For listings of those birth and accreditation errors we have uncovered thus far, please visit our webpage at www.MOHHSUS.com and click on the States listing. There you will find a link for each state with a list of birth, accreditation and Medals of Honor earned at locations with known conflicting information included. Sometimes the errors were intentional, and the recipient concealed his true information. Other times they were 'clerical errors' due to miscommunication, sloppy handwriting, or a myriad of other reasons.

The Medal of Honor is the highest award that can be bestowed on a member of the U.S. military and to have this many errors in their records is unconscionable. Currently, none of the branches of service will allow record corrections by non-family members. At one time, the Army did but in March 2022, the office responsible for the corrections oversight was changed as were the procedures themselves. If a person is not a direct family member, they are not authorized to submit a correction request. This is also true for the Navy. A request will be "returned without action" if a family member is not in the process. A request for a USMC record correction was simply ignored. Many of these recipients are Civil War era service members and finding a descendant is next to impossible.

One option is to hold a DoD review board to address the citation and accreditation errors. Pull the original files and get the truth. Don't try to rely on the poorly researched 1948 and 1949 books the Army and Navy produced. They are fraught with errors and are the source of many of the problems listed above. Additionally, many times accreditation was unknown, so the recorded place of birth was used which is also often wrong.

There is precedent for a board. The Army held one in 1916 and reviewed all Army Medal of Honor awards up to that time. A similar board could be established for citations and accreditations.

We sincerely hope that this Special Edition newsletter brings this problem to light, and steps can be taken to finally remedy the situation and get these Medal of Honor recipients the credit and respect they deserve. As the philosopher George Santayana so eloquently stated, "History is always written wrong, and so always needs to be rewritten."

To provide for the research, preservation, and documentation of The history of the individuals who have been awarded the Medal of Honor.



Board of Directors

Gayle Alvarez, President

Bill Sweeney, Vice-President

Sue Fox, Secretary

Karl Jensen, Director

Ray Johnston, Director

COL 'Doc' Ballard, MH, Honorary Director

Look for our website at: <http://www.mohhsus.com>

Newsletter articles may be edited for length or content. ★